1 2 3 4 5 6 7	Brendan P. Cullen (SBN 194057) (cullenb@sullcrom.com) Sverker K. Hogberg (SBN 244640) (hogbergs@sullcrom.com) Alexis C. Holmes (SBN 321393) (holmesa@sullcrom.com) SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP 550 Hamilton Avenue Palo Alto, CA 94301 Telephone: (650) 461-5600 Fax: (650): 461-5700 Counsel for Defendants Wells Fargo &	
8	Company, Charles W. Scharf, Kleber R. Santos, and Carly Sanchez	
9	UNITED STATES	DISTRICT COURT
10	NORTHERN DISTR	ICT OF CALIFORNIA
11	SEB INVESTMENT MANAGEMENT AB	Case No. 3:22-cv-03811-TLT
12 13	and WEST PALM BEACH FIREFIGHTERS' PENSION FUND, Individually and On Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated,	[PROPOSED] ORDER [AS
14	Plaintiffs,	MODIFIED REGARDING DEFENDANTS' LR 79-5(c)(1)
15	V.	STATEMENT IN RESPONSE TO PLAINTIFFS' ADMINISTRATIVE
16		MOTION TO CONSIDER WHETHER ANOTHER PARTY'S MATERIAL
17	WELLS FARGO & COMPANY, CHARLES W. SCHARF, KLEBER R. SANTOS and CARLY SANCHEZ,	SHOULD BE SEALED
18	Defendants.	
19	Defendants.	
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
•	Proposi	ED ORDER GRANTING DEFENDANTS' LR 79-5(C)(1) STATEMENT

[Proposed]-Order Granting Defendants' LR 79-5(c)(1) Statement Case No. 3:22-cv-03811-TLT

On August 4, 2025, Plaintiffs filed an Administrative Motion to Consider Whether Another Party's Materials Should Be Sealed in Regard to Plaintiffs' Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment, Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason, and Certain Exhibits Attached Thereto (ECF No. 233). Having considered Plaintiffs' Motion the Declaration of Sharan Nirmul In Support of Plaintiffs' Motion, Defendants Wells Fargo & Company, Charles W. Scharf, Kleber R. Santos, and Carly Sanchez's (collectively, "Defendants") LR 79-5(c)(1) Statement in Response, and the Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen in Support of Defendants' Statement in Response, it is hereby **ORDERED** that the following materials shall remain under seal:

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
Dkt. No. 236-5: Exhibit PX 5 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at 266:3-5, 23; 267:10; 268:5, 19.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	GRANTED
		Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-9: Exhibit PX 9 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00141651.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names, employment information, and factual circumstances that can be used	GRANTED

[Proposed] Order Granting Defendants' LR 79-5(c)(1) Statement Case No. 3:22-cv-03811-TLT

1 2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
3	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		to readily identify the non- party individual.	
4			r y	
5			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
6			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
7			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
8			Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398,	
9			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote,	
11			2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v.	
12			<i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
13	DI N 226 10 E 177	D 1 (1D 1	27, 2012).	CDANTED
14	Dkt. No. 236-10: Exhibit PX 10 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	GRANTED
15	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	WF_SEB_00070802- 806.	personal information of non- parties, including names,	
16	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to		employment information, and personal information, and	
17	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
18			Ten party marriages	
19			Defendants seek to redact similar information as was	
20			redacted in ECF No. 208-2, which is a different version of	
21			the same email chain as PX 10. The Court approved the	
22			redactions to ECF No. 208-2 on March 25, 2025 (ECF	
23			No. 210).	
24			Declaration of Brendan P.	
25			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
26			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
27			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i>	

-2-

PX 11 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 18 19 20 21 21 22 Dkt. No. 236-13: Exhibit PX 13 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00157774, - Proposed P	1	Daalast Na /Daalala		Evidence Offered in Support	Ruling
Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 395398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012). Dkt. No. 236-13: Exhibit PX 13 to Declaration of Identifying Redacted Personal Identifying The identified portions of this Care PX 13 to Declaration of Identifying The identified portions of this Care PX 13 to Declaration of Identifying The identified portions of this Care PX 13 to Declaration of Identifying The identified portions of this Internation, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	2		Portion Redacted		
Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012). Dkt. No. 236-11: Exhibit PX 11 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Msoin to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL Avgo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012). Dkt. No. 236-13: Exhibit PX 13 to Declaration of Identifying The identified portions of this Px 13 to Declaration of Identifying The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Px 13 to Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 3355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012). Dkt. No. 236-13: Exhibit PX 13 to Declaration of Identifying The identified portions of this				Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
Dkt. No. 236-11: Exhibit PX 11 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason Dr. Joseph R. Mason				Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
Dkt. No. 236-11: Exhibit PX 11 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 18 19 20 20 21 21 22 Dkt. No. 236-13: Exhibit PX 11 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00157774, - 777-780, -782, -785-800. Redacted Personal Information of Information of Nonparties, including names, employment information, personal information and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012). Dkt. No. 236-13: Exhibit PX 13 to Declaration of Identifying Redacted Personal Information of this indentified portions of this is that they disclose personal information of this indentified portions of this indentifie				<i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
PX 11 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason 10	7	Dkt No. 236 11: Evhibit	Padacted Personal	·	GRANTED
10 Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012). Dkt. No. 236-13: Exhibit PX 13 to Declaration of Information on Information, personal informat		PX 11 to Declaration of	Identifying	the identified portions of this	GRANTED
Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012). Dkt. No. 236-13: Exhibit PX 13 to Declaration of Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012). Dkt. No. 236-13: Exhibit PX 13 to Declaration of GR		Defendants' MSJ and (2)	777 - 780, - 782, -785-	parties, including names,	
13		Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of	000.	personal information and factual circumstances that can	
Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	12	Dr. Joseph R. Mason			
Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012). Dkt. No. 236-13: Exhibit PX 13 to Declaration of Redacted Personal Identifying The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	13				
Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012). Dkt. No. 236-13: Exhibit PX 13 to Declaration of Identifying The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this GR	14			Cullen; see also In re	
17 18 19 20 21 22 Dkt. No. 236-13: Exhibit PX 13 to Declaration of Redacted Personal Identifying The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012). Dkt. No. 236-13: Exhibit PX 13 to Declaration of Identifying The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this GR				Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012). Dkt. No. 236-13: Exhibit PX 13 to Declaration of Redacted Personal Identifying The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this				Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i>	
Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012). Dkt. No. 236-13: Exhibit PX 13 to Declaration of Redacted Personal Identifying The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	18			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
21 Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012). Dkt. No. 236-13: Exhibit PX 13 to Declaration of Identifying The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	19			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
27, 2012). 22 Dkt. No. 236-13: Exhibit Redacted Personal The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this				Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL	
PX 13 to Declaration of Identifying the identified portions of this	21				
74 II I Nugran Intermitti INTERMITTATION AT I HANDIT IS THAT THEY DISCLOSE	22 23				GRANTED
(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to WF_SEB_00072589- personal information of non-		(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	WF_SEB_00072589-	personal information of non-	
Defendants' MSJ and (2) 640, -643, -648-654. parties, in the form of names and employment information that can be used to readily identify the non-party		Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to	, 070, -043, -040-034.	and employment information that can be used to readily	
26 Dr. Joseph R. Mason individual.	26				
Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"				Cullen; see also In re	

-3-

1	Docket No./Public	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and	Ruling
2	(Sealed)		Caselaw)	
3 4 5			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
6			2015); Music Grp. Macao	
7			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v.	
8			Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
9			27, 2012); Shopify Inc. v. Express Mobile, Inc., 2020 WL	
10			4732334, at *11 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 14, 2020); <i>American</i>	
11			Auto. Ass'n of N. California, Nevada & Utah v. Gen. Motors LLC, 2019 WL 1206748, at *2	
			(N.D. Cal. Mar. 14, 2019); Opperman v. Path, Inc., 2017	
13 14			WL 1036652, at *4 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 17, 2017).	
15	Dkt. No. 236-14: Exhibit PX 14 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
16	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Information at pp. 2-44.	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
17	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to		parties, including names, employment information, and	
18	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of	See ECF No. 208-14.	personal information, and factual circumstances that can	
19	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
20			This country of this	
21			This exact version of this document was filed with redactions as ECF No. 208-14.	
22			The Court approved the redactions to ECF No. 208-14	
23			on March 25, 2025 (ECF No. 210).	
25 26			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
27			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
28			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	

-4-

2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
3 4 5 6 7			Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
8 9 10	Dkt. No. 236-15: Exhibit PX 15 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00599218, -	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	GRANTED
11	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to	222, -228, -230, -233- 235, 237-238, -24-243, -246, -251-252, -262, -	parties, in the form of names, employment information, and factual circumstances that can	
12	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	271-274, -291, -293, - 297, -298, -301-302, - 304, -305, -306-308, -	be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
13 14		311, -316, -317, -319, - 321-322, -325, -326, - 322, -336, -347, -355, -	Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
15		358, -359, -361-362, - 364, -365, -368, -372-	Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
16		373, -376, -378, -380- 381, -384-386, -390, - 395, -400, -404, and -	Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l	
17 18		405.	Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
19			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
20			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
21 22			27, 2012); Shopify Inc. v. Express Mobile, Inc., 2020 WL 4732334, at *11 (N.D. Cal.	
23			Aug. 14, 2020); American Auto. Ass'n of N. California,	
24			Nevada & Utah v. Gen. Motors LLC, 2019 WL 1206748, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 14, 2019);	
25 26			Opperman v. Path, Inc., 2017 WL 1036652, at *4 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 17, 2017).	
27	Dkt. No. 236-16; Exhibit PX 16 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	GRANTED

-5-

1	Darlast Na /Darlas		Evidence Offered in Support	Ruling
2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	
3	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	WF_SEB_00176695, - 697-699.	personal information of non- parties, including names and personal information that can	
5	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
6	Dr. Joseph R. Mason			
7			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
8			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
9			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
10			Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398,	
11			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
12			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
13			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
14			1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Shopify Inc.</i> v. <i>Express Mobile, Inc.</i> , 2020 WL	
15			4732334, at *11 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 14, 2020); American	
16			Auto. Ass'n of N. California, Nevada & Utah v. Gen. Motors	
17			<i>LLC</i> , 2019 WL 1206748, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 14, 2019);	
18			<i>Opperman</i> v. <i>Path</i> , <i>Inc.</i> , 2017 WL 1036652, at *4 (N.D. Cal.	
19			Mar. 17, 2017).	
20	Dkt. No. 236-17: Exhibit PX 17 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
21	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSL and (2)	Information at WF_SEB_00137913, - 917-918, -920-921.	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
22	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	917-918, -920-921.	parties, including names and employment information that	
23	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
24	Di. Joseph K. Wason			
25			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
26			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
27			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l	
28			Table 2 is 2010 is 11 mile 1. Could be	

-6-

1 2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
3 4			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
5			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
6			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
7			27, 2012); Shopify Inc. v. Express Mobile, Inc., 2020 WL	
8			4732334, at *11 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 14, 2020); American Auto. Ass'n of N. California,	
10			Nevada & Utah v. Gen. Motors LLC, 2019 WL 1206748, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 14, 2019);	
11			Opperman v. Path, Inc., 2017 WL 1036652, at *4 (N.D. Cal.	
12	Dkt. No. 236-19: Exhibit	Redacted Personal	Mar. 17, 2017). The factual basis for sealing	GRANTED
13	PX 19 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Identifying Information at pp. 3-4,	the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	GRANTED
14 15	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	7, 12-13.	personal information of non- parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily	
16	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		identify the non-party individual.	
17	Dr. Joseph R. Mason			
18			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
19			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
20			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i>	
22			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
23			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
24			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
25			1497489, at *Î (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
26	Dkt. No. 236-20: Exhibit PX 20 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
2728	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	Information at 35:10; 69:11, 13, 18; 70:17,	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names	
		-7-		

1 2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
3	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of	20; 218:5, 9.	that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		marviadu.	
5			Declaration of Brendan P.	
6			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
7			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
8			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i>	
9			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
11			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
12			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
13			1497489, at *Î (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
14	Dkt. No. 236-23: Exhibit PX 23 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
15	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	Information at WF_SEB_00121257-258.	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names and	
16	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to		employment information.	
17	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	See ECF No. 208-6.	This exact version of this	
18	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		document was filed with redactions as ECF No. 208-6.	
19			The Court approved the redactions to ECF No. 208-6	
20			on March 25, 2025 (ECF	
21			No. 210).	
22			Declaration of Brendan P.	
23			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mitta Salas Praes & Praeda	
24			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
25			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i>	
26			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
27			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
28				

-8-

1 2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
3 4			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
5	Dkt. No. 236-24: Exhibit	Redacted Personal	The factual basis for sealing	GRANTED
6	PX 24 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Identifying Information at	the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	
7	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	WF_SEB_00121479.	personal information of non- parties, including names and	
8	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		employment information that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
9	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		the new policy maz-radius.	
10			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
12			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
13			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i> <i>Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398,	
14			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
15 16			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
17			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
18	Dkt. No. 236-27: Exhibit	Redacted Personal	27, 2012). The factual basis for sealing	GRANTED
19	PX 27 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Identifying Information at	the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	GRANTED
20	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	WF_SEB_00161676.	personal information of non- parties, in the form of names	
21	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to		that can be used to readily identify the non-party	
22 23	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		individual.	
24			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
25			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
26			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
27 28			Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao</i>	

-9-

1 2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
3 4			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v.	
5			<i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
6 7	Dkt. No. 236-31: Exhibit PX 31 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at 91:10;	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose parsonal information of non	GRANTED
8	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to	153:7-9, 14-16, 19-20, 23; 154:15, 22; 186:15, 25.	personal information of non- parties, in the form of names, that can be used to readily identify the non-party	
10	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		individual.	
11 12			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
13			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
14 15			Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
16			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
17 18			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
19	Dkt. No. 236-34: Exhibit	Redacted Personal	The feeting having for seeling	GRANTED
20	PX 34 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Identifying Information at pp. 1-	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	GRANTED
21 22	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	23.	personal information of non- parties, including names, employment information, and	
23	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the	
24	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		non-party individual.	
25			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
26			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
27 28			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l	

-10-

1	Docket No./Public		Evidence Offered in Support	Ruling
2	(Sealed)	Portion Redacted	of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	
3			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
5			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
6			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
7	DI V 226 26 E 177	D 1 (1D 1	27, 2012).	CD ANTEED
8	Dkt. No. 236-36: Exhibit PX 36 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	GRANTED
9	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	WF_SEB_00328507- 501.	personal information of non- parties, including names,	
11	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		employment information, personal information and factual circumstances that can	
12	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
13				
14			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
15			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
16 17			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i>	
18			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
19			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
20			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
21			1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
22	Dkt. No. 236-37: Exhibit PX 37 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
23	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Information at WF SEB 00138485-	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
24	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	486.	parties, including names, employment information,	
25	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		personal information and factual circumstances that can	
26	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
27				
28			Declaration of Brendan P.	

-11-

1 2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
3 4			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
5			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
6			Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
7			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote,	
8			2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
10			1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
11	Dkt. No. 236-39: Exhibit PX 39 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
12	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Information at WF_SEB_00011936-	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
13	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to	939.	parties, including names, employment information, and factual circumstances that can	
14 15	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
16				
17			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
18			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
19			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i> <i>Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398,	
20			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
21 22			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
23			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
24	DI. N. 226 50 F 1314	D 1 (1D 1	27, 2012).	CDANTED
25	Dkt. No. 236-50: Exhibit PX 40 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at 16:8,	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	GRANTED
26	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	134:22, 135:1-4, 7, 9, 13-17, 22; 136:4, 11.	personal information of non- parties, in the form of names,	
27 28	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		that can be used to readily identify the non-party	
		-12-		

-12-

1 2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
3	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		individual.	
4				
5			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re</i>	
6			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
7			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
8			Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398,	
9			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao</i>	
10			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
11			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
12			1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
13	Dkt. No. 236-43: Exhibit PX 43 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	GRANTED
14 15	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	WF_SEB_00500874, - 895, -902.	personal information of non- parties, in the form of names,	
16	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
17	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		marviduai.	
18			Declaration of Brendan P.	
19			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
20			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
21			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i> <i>Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398,	
22			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
23			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote,	
24			2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v.	
25			Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
26	Dkt. No. 236-44: Exhibit	Redacted Personal	27, 2012). The factual basis for sealing	GRANTED
27	PX 44 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Identifying Information at	the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	
28	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	WF_SEB_00507421, -	personal information of non- parties, in the form of names,	
		-13-		

1 2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
3 4	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	433.	that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
5	Di. vosepii R. iviason			
6			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
7			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
8			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i>	
9			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
11			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
12			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
13			1497489, at *Ī (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
14	Dkt. No. 236-45: Exhibit PX 45 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
15	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	Information at pp. 1-4, 8-14, 16-17, 19, and 21.	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
16	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to	21.	parties, including names, and employment information that can be used to readily identify	
17	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		the non-party individual.	
18 19			Declaration of Brendan P.	
20			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
21			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
22			Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398,	
23			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao</i>	
24			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
25			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
26			1497489, at *Î (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
27	Dkt. No. 236-46: Exhibit PX 46 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing	GRANTED
28	Sharan Nirmul ISO	Information at	the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	
		-14-		

1	Docket No./Public		Evidence Offered in Support	Ruling
2	(Sealed)	Portion Redacted	of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	
3 4	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	WF_SEB_00140420, - 422-423.	personal information of non- parties, including names and employment information that	
5	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
6	Br. vesepii itt iviaseii		Declaration of Brendan P.	
7			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
8			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
9			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i> <i>Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398,	
11			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
12			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
13			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
14			27, 2012).	
15	Dkt. No. 236-48: Exhibit PX 48 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	GRANTED
16	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	WF_SEB_00172661- 662, -664, -666.	personal information of non- parties, including names,	
17	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to	002, 001, 000.	employment information, and personal information that can	
18	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
19	1			
20			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
22			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
23			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
24			Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398,	
25			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote,	
26			2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v.	
27			Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
28			27, 2012).	

-15-

1	Docket No./Public		Evidence Offered in Support	Ruling
2	(Sealed)	Portion Redacted	of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	
3	Dkt. No. 236-49: Exhibit PX 49 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	GRANTED
5	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	WF_SEB_00172678- 681.	personal information of non- parties, including names and personal information that can	
6	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
7	Dr. Joseph R. Mason			
8			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
10			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
11			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i> <i>Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398,	
12			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao</i>	
13			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
14 15			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
16			27, 2012).	
17	Dkt. No. 236-50: Exhibit PX 50 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	GRANTED
18	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	WF_SEB_00148888.	personal information of non- parties, including information	
19	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to		relating to protected classes.	
20	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
21 22			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
23			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l	
24			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
25			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote,	
26			2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v.	
27			<i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
28			· , - · ,·	

-16-

1	Darlass No. (Darlass		Evidence Offered in Support	Ruling
2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	g
3	Dkt. No. 236-51: Exhibit PX 51 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at 128:4,	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	GRANTED
5	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	22; 130:9, 20; 131:15.	personal information of non- parties, in the form of names	
6	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
7	Dr. Joseph R. Mason			
8			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
9			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
11			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i> <i>Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398,	
12			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao</i>	
13 14			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v.	
15			Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
16	Dkt. No. 236-53: Exhibit	Redacted Personal	The factual basis for sealing	GRANTED
17	PX 53 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Identifying Information at 144:24, 25; 145:10, 13, 17;	the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
18 19	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	146:9-10, 14; 147:5-6, 12-13, 15.	parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily	
20	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		identify the non-party individual.	
21	1		Declaration of Brendan P.	
22			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
23			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
24			Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398,	
25			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao</i>	
26 27			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
28			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
20				

-17-

1	Docket No./Public		Evidence Offered in Support	Ruling
2	(Sealed)	Portion Redacted	of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	
3			1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
5	Dkt. No. 236-54: Exhibit PX 54 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
6	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Information at 183:25; 229:8; 230:6, 11, 14,	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
7	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to	19, 25; 231:8, 15, 18.	parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party	
8	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		individual.	
9			Declaration of Brendan P.	
10			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
11			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
12			Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398,	
13			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao</i>	
14 15			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
16			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
17	DI A M. 226 57 E 1314	D 1 (1D 1	27, 2012).	CD ANTEED
18	Dkt. No. 236-57: Exhibit PX 57 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
19	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	WF_SEB_00236958, - 960, -962-965.	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names	
20	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to	700, -702-703.	that can be used to readily identify the non-party	
21	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		individual.	
22			Declaration of Brendan P.	
23			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
24			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
25			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i>	
26			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
27 28			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
20	1	10	2010 11 L 3//317/, at 2 (11.D.	

-18-

1 2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
3 4			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
5	Dkt. No. 236-60: Exhibit	Redacted Personal	The factual basis for sealing	GRANTED
6	PX 61 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Identifying Information at 136:6,	the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	
7	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	16; 137:8; 140:1, 7; 225:4, 7; 260:2, 8;	personal information of non- parties, including names,	
8	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to	261:14-15, 22; 262:8; 263:4-5; 340:5-6, 10;	employment information, personal information, and	
9	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	341:4; 342:23; 343:1, 8, 18.	factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
10				
11			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
12			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
13			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
14			Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398,	
15 16			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao</i>	
17			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v.	
18			<i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
19	D1. N. 226 (2 F 13)	D 1 (1D 1	27, 2012).	CDANTED
20	Dkt. No. 236-62: Exhibit PX 63 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
21	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Information at WF_SEB_00445493-	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
22	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	576.	parties, including names, employment information,	
23	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		personal information, and factual circumstances that can	
24	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
25				
26			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
27			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Ligh Litin 2016 WI	
28			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
		10		

-19-

1 2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
3 4			Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
5			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
6			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
7			27, 2012).	
8	Dkt. No. 236-63: Exhibit PX 64 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at pp. 1-2.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
10	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	imormation at pp. 1-2.	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names	
11	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to		that can be used to readily identify the non-party	
12	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		individual.	
13			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
14 15			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
16			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
17			Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
18			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote,	
19			2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v.	
20			<i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
21	Dkt. No. 236-64: Exhibit PX 65 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
23	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Information at WF SEB 00146646.	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
24	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to		parties, including names and employment information that	
25	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
26	Di. Joseph K. Mason		Declaration of Draw Jon D	
27			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
28			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	

-20-

1 2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
3 4			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l	
5			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
6			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
7 8			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
9	DI 1 226 (0 E 171)	D 1 . 1D 1	27, 2012).	CD ANTEED
10	Dkt. No. 236-68: Exhibit PX 70 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at 193:1,	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	GRANTED
11	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	11, 14, 18; 194:7, 12- 13; 195:12-13, 18, 22;	personal information of non- parties, in the form of names	
12	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to	196:7, 10, 24-25.	that can be used to readily identify the non-party	
13	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		individual.	
14			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
15 16			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
17			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l	
18			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
19			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
20			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
21			1497489, at *Î (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
23	Dkt. No. 236-69: Exhibit PX 71 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
24	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSI and (2)	Information at WF_SEB_00109725-727.	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
25	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to	121.	parties, including names and employment information that can be used to readily identify	
26	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		the non-party individual.	
27 28			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	

-21-

1	Docket No./Public	Doution Dodg stod	Evidence Offered in Support	Ruling
2	(Sealed)	Portion Redacted	of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	
3			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
5			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i> <i>Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398,	
6			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao</i>	
7			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
8 9			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
10	Dkt. No. 236-71: Exhibit	Redacted Personal	27, 2012). The factual basis for sealing	GRANTED
11	PX 74 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Identifying Information at	the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	
12	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	WF_SEB_00261082- 083.	personal information of non- parties, in the form of names	
13	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to		that can be used to readily identify the non-party	
14	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		individual.	
15			Declaration of Brendan P.	
16			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
17			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
18			Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398,	
19			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao</i>	
20			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
22			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
23			1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
24	Dkt. No. 236-72: Exhibit PX 75 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
25	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Information at WF_SEB_00359005-	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
26	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	006.	parties, including names, employment information,	
27	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		personal information, and factual circumstances that can	
28	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		be used to readily identify the	
		22		

-22-

1 2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
3			non-party individual.	
4				
5			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re</i>	
6			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
7			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
8			Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398,	
9			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao</i>	
10			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
11			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
12			27, 2012).	
13	Dkt. No. 236-73: Exhibit PX 76 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
14	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Information at WF_SEB_00149700-	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
15	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	701.	parties, including names and personal information that can	
16	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of	See ECF No. 224-14.	be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
17	Dr. Joseph R. Mason			
18			This exact version of this document was filed with	
19			redactions as ECF No. 224-14. The Court approved the	
20			redactions to ECF No. 224-14 on July 8, 2025 (ECF No. 228).	
21			Declaration of Brendan P.	
22			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
23			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
24			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
25			Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398,	
26			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
27			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
28		<u> </u>	Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v.	

-23-

1 2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and	Ruling
3			Caselaw) Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL	
4			1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Shopify Inc.</i> v.	
5			Express Mobile, Inc., 2020 WL 4732334, at *11 (N.D. Cal.	
6			Aug. 14, 2020); American Auto. Ass'n of N. California,	
7			Nevada & Utah v. Gen. Motors LLC, 2019 WL 1206748, at *2	
8			(N.D. Cal. Mar. 14, 2019); <i>Opperman</i> v. <i>Path</i> , <i>Inc.</i> , 2017 WL 1036652, at *4 (N.D. Cal.	
9			Mar. 17, 2017).	
10	Dkt. No. 236-80: Exhibit PX 83 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
11	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Information at pp. 1, 3-4.	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
12	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to		parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily	
13	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		identify the non-party individual.	
14	Dr. Joseph R. Mason			
15			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re</i>	
16			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
17			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
18			Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398,	
19			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
20			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v.	
21 22			<i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
23	Dkt. No. 236-81: Exhibit	Redacted Personal	27, 2012). The factual basis for sealing	GRANTED
24	PX 84 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Identifying Information at p. 1.	the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	SIGHTIED
	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	imornacion at p. 1.	personal information of non-	
25	Plaintiffs' Opp. to		parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily	
2627	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		identify the non-party individual.	
28			Declaration of Brendan P.	
		24		

-24-

1 2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
3			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
5			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
6			Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398,	
7			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
8			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v.	
9			<i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
11	Dkt. No. 236-82: Exhibit PX 85 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
12	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Information at pp. 1, 3.	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
13	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to		parties, including names, employment information,	
14	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		personal information, and factual circumstances that can	
15	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
16			Declaration of Brendan P.	
17			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
18			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
19			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i>	
20 21			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
22			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote,	
23			2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v.	
24			<i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
25	Dkt. No. 236-86: Exhibit	Redacted Personal	The factual basis for sealing	GRANTED
26	PX 89 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Identifying Information at	the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	
27	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	WF_SEB_00358890- 893.	personal information of non- parties, in the form of names	
28	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to		that can be used to readily identify the non-party	
		-25-		

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		individual.	
		Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
		Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
		11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i>	
		Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
		Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v.	
		<i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
Dkt. No. 236-87: Exhibit	Redacted Personal	27, 2012). The factual basis for sealing	GRANTEI
PX 90 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Identifying Information at	the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	
(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	WF_SEB_00147074- 075.	personal information of non- parties, including names, employment information, and	
Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the	
Dr. Joseph R. Mason		non-party individual.	
		Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
		Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
		Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l	
		Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
		2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao</i> <i>Com. Offshore Ltd.</i> v. <i>Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
		Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-88: Exhibit PX 91 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTE
Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Information at WF SEB 00358918-	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	

1 2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and	Ruling
	Defendants' MSJ and (2)	920.	Caselaw) parties, in the form of names	
3 4	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to	920.	that can be used to readily identify the non-party	
5	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		individual.	
6			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
7			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
8			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l	
10			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
11			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote,	
12			2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v.	
13			<i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
14	Dkt. No. 236-90: Exhibit	Redacted Personal	The factual basis for sealing	GRANTED
15	PX 93 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Identifying Information at 76:12,	the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	
16	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	18; 77:25; 78:9; 79:23; 80:8, 17-18.	personal information of non- parties, in the form of names	
17	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
18	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		marviduai.	
19			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
20 21			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
22			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
23			Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398,	
24			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
25			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v.	
26			Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL	
27			1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
28	Dkt. No. 236-108: Exhibit PX 111 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
		-27-		

-27

1	Docket No./Public	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and	Ruling
2	(Sealed)	I of tion Redacted	Caselaw)	
3 4	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	Information at WF_SEB_00020858-859.	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names and	
5	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		personal information that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
6	Dr. Joseph R. Mason			
7			Defendants seek to redact the same information that was	
8			redacted in ECF No. 224-14, which is a different version of the same email chain as	
10			PX 111. The Court approved the redactions to ECF No. 224-14 on July 8, 2025 (ECF	
11			No. 228).	
12			Destantian of Days 1-1 D	
13			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
14			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
15 16			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i> <i>Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398,	
			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
17			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
18			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v.	
19 20			Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); Shopify Inc. v.	
21			Express Mobile, Inc., 2020 WL 4732334, at *11 (N.D. Cal.	
22			Aug. 14, 2020); American Auto. Ass'n of N. California,	
23			Nevada & Utah v. Gen. Motors LLC, 2019 WL 1206748, at *2	
24			(N.D. Cal. Mar. 14, 2019); Opperman v. Path, Inc., 2017	
25			WL 1036652, at *4 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 17, 2017).	
26	Dkt. No. 236-121: Exhibit	Redacted Personal	The factual basis for sealing	GRANTED
27	PX 128 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Identifying Information at	the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	
28	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	WF_SEB_00438073.	personal information of non- parties, including names and	
		-28-		

1 2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
3	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		employment information that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
5	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		1 2	
			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
6			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
7			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
8			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i>	
9			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
11			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
12			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
13			1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
14	Dkt. No. 236-124: Exhibit PX 133 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
15	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Information at WF SEB 00146906-	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
16	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	907.	parties, including names, employment information,	
17	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of	See ECF No. 208-16.	personal information, and factual circumstances that can	
18	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
19				
20			This exact version of this document was filed with	
21			redactions as ECF No. 208-16. The Court approved the	
22			redactions to ECF No. 208-16 on March 25, 2025 (ECF	
23			No. 210).	
24			Declaration of Brendan P.	
25			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
26			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
27			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i>	
28			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398,	

-29-

1	Docket No./Public	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and	Ruling
2	(Sealed)	1 or tron reducted	Caselaw)	
3 4			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao</i> <i>Com. Offshore Ltd.</i> v. <i>Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
5			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
			27, 2012).	
7 8	Dkt. No. 236-125: Exhibit PX 135 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	GRANTED
9	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	WF_SEB_00236919- 949.	personal information of non- parties, including names,	
10	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to		employment information, personal information, and	
11	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the	
12			non-party individual.	
13			Declaration of Brendan P.	
14			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.	
15 16			Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
17			Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
18			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote,	
19			2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v.	
20			Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr.	
21	Dkt. No. 236-126: Exhibit	Redacted Personal	27, 2012). The factual basis for sealing	GRANTED
22	PX 136 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Identifying Information at	the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	
23	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	WF_SEB_00151378- 382.	personal information of non- parties, including names,	
24	Defendants' Motion to		employment information, and personal information that can	
25	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
26			Declaration of Brendan P.	
27 28			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	

-30-

1 2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and	Ruling
	(Scalcu)		Caselaw)	
3 4			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
5			Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
6			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote,	
7			2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v.	
8			<i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
9	Dkt. No. 236-127: Exhibit PX 137 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal	The factual basis for sealing	GRANTED
11	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Identifying Information at WF SEB 00281731-	the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
12	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	32, -735-736, -740, - 744, -746.	parties, including names and employment information that	
13	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of	744, -740.	can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
14	Dr. Joseph R. Mason			
15			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
16			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
17			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i>	
18			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
19 20			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
21			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
22			1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
23	Dkt. No. 236-129: Exhibit PX 139 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
24	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Information at WF SEB 00518583-	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
25	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	584.	parties, including names, employment information,	
26	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		personal information, and factual circumstances that can	
27	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
28			,	

-31-

2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
3 4			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
5			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
7			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i> <i>Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398,	
8			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao</i>	
9			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v.	
10 11			<i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
12	Dkt. No. 236-130: Exhibit	Redacted Personal	The factual basis for sealing	GRANTED
13	PX 140 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Identifying Information at WF SEB 00338391-	the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
14	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	392.	parties, including names, employment information,	
15 16	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		personal information, and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the	
17	Dr. Joseph R. Wason		non-party individual.	
18			Declaration of Brendan P.	
19			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
20			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
1			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i> <i>Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398,	
22			at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao	
23			Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
24			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
25			1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
26	Dkt. No. 236-132: Exhibit PX 142 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
27 28	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Information at pp. 1, 3.	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	

1	Docket No./Public		Evidence Offered in Support	Ruling
2	(Sealed)	Portion Redacted	of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	
3	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to		parties, in the form of names, employment information, personal information, and	
5	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
6			non party marvidua.	
7			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re	
8			Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
9			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i>	
11			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
12			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote,	
13			2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
14			1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
15	Dkt. No. 236-137: Exhibit PX 147 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
16 17	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Information at WF_SEB_00358913-	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
18	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	914.	parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily	
19	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		identify the non-party individual.	
20	Bri vesepri iti iriasen		Declaration of Brendan P.	
21			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
22			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
23			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i>	
24			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
25			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
26			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
27 28			1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
40		1	1	

-33-

1	Docket No./Public		Evidence Offered in Support	Ruling
2	(Sealed)	Portion Redacted	of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	
3 4	Dkt. No. 236-138: Exhibit PX 148 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	GRANTED
5	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	WF_SEB_00594621.	personal information of non- parties, in the form of names	
6	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	
7	Dr. Joseph R. Mason			
8			Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
10			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
11			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i>	
12			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
13			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	
14			Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
15			1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
16	Dkt. No. 236-139: Exhibit PX 149 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED
17	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Information at WF_SEB_00252564-	Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	
18	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	565.	parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily	
20	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		identify the non-party individual.	
21	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		Declaration of Brendan P.	
22			Cullen; see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"	
23			Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL	
24			11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l</i>	
25			Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14,	
26			2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote,	
27			2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
28			Kuvo Am. Corp., 2012 WL	<u> </u>

-34-

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	

Upon consideration of the papers filed by the parties in connection with the Motion, it is hereby

ORDERED that the following exhibits shall be sealed in their entirety:

7 8	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
9	Dkt. No. 236-41: Exhibit PX 41 to Declaration of	Entire Document	The factual basis for sealing this Exhibit is that it discloses	GRANTED
10	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to		personal information of non-parties, including names,	
11 12	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to		employment information, personal information, and	
13	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the	
14	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		non-party individual.	
15			Defendants' request to file this Exhibit in its entirety as it	
16			is a spreadsheet with over 3,500 rows that contain	
17			confidential information throughout, such that there is	
18			no suitable alternative to sealing the entire document.	
19			C. J IV. II "Cl	
20			See In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016	
21			WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v.	
22			Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
23			Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v.	
24			Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015);	
25			Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1	
2627			(N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); Bohannon v. Facebook, Inc.,	
28			2019 WL 188671, at *6 (N.D. Cal. Jan. 14, 2019); <i>Murphy</i> v.	
20		25		

-35-

1

2

3

4

5

6

1	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual	Ruling
2	Docket 110.71 ubite (Scared)	1 of tion reducted	Basis and Caselaw)	
3			Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); Kazda v.	
5			Aetna Life Ins. Co., 2022 WL 1225032, at *11 (N.D. Cal.	
6			Apr. 26, 2022); Chula Vista Elem. Sch. Dist. v. Penagos,	
7			2024 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 147870, at *5 (S.D. Cal. Aug.	
8			19, 2024); <i>Kimera Labs Inc</i> v. <i>Jayashankar</i> , 2025 WL 1399199, at *2 (S.D. Cal.	
9	Dkt. No. 236-42: Exhibit	Entire Document	May 14, 2025).	GRANTED
10	PX 42 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Entire Document	The factual basis for sealing this Exhibit is that it discloses personal information of	GRANTED
11	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)		non-parties, including names, employment information, and	
12	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to		factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the	
13	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		non-party individual.	
14	Dr. voseph re. Mason		Defendants' request to file	
15			this Exhibit in its entirety as it is a spreadsheet with over	
16			10,000 rows that contain confidential information	
17			throughout, such that there is no suitable alternative to	
18			sealing the entire document.	
19			See In re Volkswagen "Clean	
20			Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016	
21			WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v.	
22			Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
23			Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v.	
24			Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015);	
25			Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1	
26			(N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); Bohannon v. Facebook, Inc.,	
27			2019 WL 188671, at *6 (N.D. Cal. Jan. 14, 2019); <i>Murphy</i> v.	
28			1 Cal. Jan. 17, 2017], WINDIN V.	
	-36-			

1			Evidence Offered in	Ruling
2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	
3			Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); Kazda v.	
5			Aetna Life Ins. Co., 2022 WL 1225032, at *11 (N.D. Cal.	
6			Apr. 26, 2022); Chula Vista Elem. Sch. Dist. v. Penagos,	
7			2024 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 147870, at *5 (S.D. Cal. Aug. 19, 2024); <i>Kimera Labs Inc</i> v.	
8			Jayashankar, 2025 WL 1399199, at *2 (S.D. Cal. May 14, 2025).	
9	Dkt. No. 236-123: Exhibit PX 132 to Declaration of	Entire Document	The factual basis for sealing this Exhibit is that it discloses	GRANTED
11	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to		personal information of non-parties, including names	
12	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to		and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify	
13	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		the non-party individual.	
14	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		Defendants' request to file	
15			this Exhibit in its entirety as it is a spreadsheet with over 397	
16			rows that contain confidential information throughout, such	
17			that there is no suitable alternative to sealing the	
18			entire document.	
19			See In re Volkswagen "Clean	
20			Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D.	
21			Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL	
22			5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp</i> .	
23			Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at	
24			*2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.,	
25			2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012);	
26			Bohannon v. Facebook, Inc., 2019 WL 188671, at *6 (N.D.	
2728			Cal. Jan. 14, 2019); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL	
40		-37-		
		-3/-		

1			Evidence Offered in	Ruling
2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	
3			1497489, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Kazda</i> v.	
4			Aetna Life Ins. Co., 2022 WL 1225032, at *11 (N.D. Cal.	
5			Apr. 26, 2022); <i>Chula Vista Elem. Sch. Dist.</i> v. <i>Penagos</i> ,	
6			2024 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 147870, at *5 (S.D. Cal. Aug.	
7			19, 2024); Kimera Labs Inc v. Jayashankar, 2025 WL	
8			1399199, at *2 (S.D. Cal. May 14, 2025).	
9	Dkt. No. 236-128: Exhibit	Entire Document	The factual basis for sealing	GRANTED
10	PX 138 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO		this Exhibit is that it discloses personal information of	
11	(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)		non-parties, including names, employee identification	
12	Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to		numbers, work locations, and information related to	
13	Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		protected classes that can be used to readily identify the	
14			non-party individual.	
15			Defendants' request to file this Exhibit in its entirety as it	
16			is a spreadsheet with over 132,000 rows that contain	
17			confidential information throughout such that there is	
18			no suitable alternative to sealing the entire document.	
19			searing the entire document.	
20			See In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs.,	
21			& Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D.	
22			Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v. <i>Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL	
23			5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp</i> .	
24			Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at	
25			*2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.,	
26			2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012);	
27			Bohannon v. Facebook, Inc., 2019 WL 188671, at *6 (N.D.	
28				
	-38-			

1			Evidence Offered in	Ruling
2	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	
3			Cal. Jan. 14, 2019); <i>Murphy</i> v. <i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
5			Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Kazda</i> v. <i>Aetna Life Ins. Co.</i> , 2022 WL	
6			1225032, at *11 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 26, 2022); <i>Chula Vista</i>	
7			Elem. Sch. Dist. v. Penagos, 2024 U.S. Dist. LEXIS	
8			147870, at *5 (S.D. Cal. Aug. 19, 2024); <i>Kimera Labs Inc</i> v. <i>Jayashankar</i> , 2025 WL 1399199, at *2 (S.D. Cal.	
			May 14, 2025).	
10	Dkt. No. 236-131: Exhibit PX 141 to Declaration of	Entire Document	The factual basis for sealing this Exhibit is that it discloses	GRANTED
11	Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to		personal information of non-parties, including names	
12	Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to		and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify	
13	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of		the non-party individual.	
14 15	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		Defendants' request to file	
16			this Exhibit in its entirety as it is a spreadsheet with over	
17			1,667 rows that contain confidential information	
18			throughout such that there is no suitable alternative to	
19			sealing the entire document.	
20			See In re Volkswagen "Clean	
21			Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig., 2016	
22			WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt</i> v.	
23			Cont'l Cas. Co., 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	
24			Sept. 14, 2015); Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v.	
25			Foote, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015);	
26			Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *1	
27			(N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); Bohannon v. Facebook, Inc.,	
28			2019 WL 188671, at *6 (N.D. Cal. Jan. 14, 2019); <i>Murphy</i> v.	
20		-39-		
	-37-			

1			Evidence Offered in	Ruling
	Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Support of Sealing (Factual	Kunng
2	,		Basis and Caselaw)	
3 4			Kavo Am. Corp., 2012 WL 1497489, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); Kazda v.	
5			Aetna Life Ins. Co., 2022 WL 1225032, at *11 (N.D. Cal.	
6			Apr. 26, 2022); Chula Vista Elem. Sch. Dist. v. Penagos, 2024 U.S. Dist. LEXIS	
7			147870, at *5 (S.D. Cal. Aug. 19, 2024); <i>Kimera Labs Inc</i> v. <i>Jayashankar</i> , 2025 WL	
8 9			1399199, at *2 (S.D. Cal. May 14, 2025).	
10 11	Document	Materials to Be Filed Under Seal or Redacted	Basis for Sealing or Redaction	Ruling
12	Plaintiffs' Opposition		Containing, describing, referencing, or implicating	GRANTED
13	to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment	Highlighted material at pp. 1-22, 24	information designated confidential by Defendants under the Stipulated	GRANTED
14 15			Protective Order (Dkt. No. 157).	
16	Plaintiffs' Opposition to	Highlighted material at	Containing, describing,	
17	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of	p. 11	referencing, or implicating information designated	GRANTED
18	Dr. Joseph R. Mason		confidential by Defendants under the Stipulated Protective Order (Dkt. No.	
19 20			157).	
21	DATED: September 25, 2025 Hon. Trina L. Thompson United States District Judge Northern District of California			
22				
23				
25				
26				
27				
28				

-40-